



## STAFF REPORT

SUBMITTED BY: Chris Frotten

DATE: March 6, 2020

SUBJECT: Janitorial Services

### ORIGIN

On February 7, 2020, Richard Enslow of Enslow's Maintenance & Cleaning Services notified the Municipality that he would not be accepting the tender we awarded to him for the municipality's janitorial services. Due to this decision, and the high tendered price of the other bidder, we have been forced to analyze the outsourcing of this service.

### BACKGROUND

Since 2014, The Municipality has been contracting janitorial services to Enslow's Maintenance and Cleaning Services for the Administrative Centre, Recreation Centre and Library/CED Centre. In addition to the contracted services for those facilities, we also contract the cleaning of Dr. Yee's intern's office and exam room and Dr. Pierce's medical clinic. Since contracting the service, the arena and VIC have been cleaned by municipal staff when needed and possible.

Prior to contracting this service, the Municipality employed a municipal janitor which provided the janitorial services to all our facilities. The cleaning of Dr. Yee's intern's office and exam room has always been separate and now we have since added the cleaning of Dr. Pierce's medical clinic.

### DISCUSSION

The only other bidder's total cost for the first year of the contract would have been \$90,541.80. For this reason, we have been forced to analyze the outsourcing of this service and consider whether performing the duties in-house would benefit the Municipality.

Outsourcing is not appropriate or cost-effective in every situation, but it does provide the potential to reduce costs or improve service quality. Furthermore, the act of considering outsourcing is part and parcel of ongoing efforts to ensure that services are provided at the desired quality and at the lowest available cost.

Outsourcing does not concern itself with who provides the service but rather on key factors that tend to matter to residents – is the service being provided effectively, are performance goals being met, and is the cost of doing so as low as possible.

In this case, we analyzed the three following factors:

### **Cost**

Outsourcing can reduce costs relative to public sector service provision. Financial savings are often possible through the ability to access lower private market wage and benefit rates and by receiving the benefit of capital assets, operating techniques and knowledge of external parties who specialize in particular services. In addition, outsourcing allows municipalities to shift the cost of unemployment benefits, workers compensation and other items to the contractor, generally reducing the direct cost of these items to the taxpayers.

That being said, services that are difficult to define and whose outcomes are difficult to quantify are generally difficult to outsource. Seeking private competition for these services could potentially be unproductive or result in higher costs if the work is not properly defined or if outcomes are improperly measured.

*A cost analysis is provided in the “budget implications” section.*

### **Market Competition**

Outsourcing often involves market competition for services. This provides public sector agencies the opportunity to access more modern, flexible approaches to providing a service than may not have evolved through internal service provision. That being said, services that rely on only one or two potential vendors can be more expensive and bring less innovation to an outsourcing. Lack of competition can also force a municipality to remain in an unsuccessful contract because it can not easily cancel a contract and engage another vendor. It is important to analyze the municipality’s ability to in-source the service if necessary, including the availability of land, capital, equipment and staff, as appropriate.

*In this case, there are very few local companies and only a handful of companies provincially that provide an all-inclusive cleaning service. There are private individuals that provide small-scale cleaning, but it would take a number of these individuals to fulfill our needs which is not effective.*

### **Measuring and Managing Outcomes**

Other than cost, this is the most important factor in the analysis. Shifting staffing responsibilities to a contractor allows us to focus on measuring and managing outcomes rather than dealing with significant input issues. For example, in order to manage in-house service provision, we must hire and manage personnel, address HR issues and ensure sufficient staff is on hand each day who are appropriately trained. We must also ensure necessary and adequate equipment and supplies are also available to provide the service in question.

By the same token, employers can, in certain circumstances, shift employees to other functions depending on the needs of the department which provides greater flexibility. For example, a Property Services Technician could be assigned to rebuild a storm water drain on Monday and then to solid waste removal on Tuesday. This is often not the case with an outsourced service.

*In comparing the time required to manage an employee versus measuring and managing outcomes of a contractor providing the entire service, there is very little difference in this case. However, hiring a number of local individuals to fulfill our needs would be more time consuming and would not be feasible for senior management to maintain direct oversight of the outsourced service for an extended period of time to ensure problems are being addressed and the individuals are receiving appropriate feedback from municipal agencies.*

*Also, due to the fluid scheduling of our facilities and, in some cases, unique uses, the flexibility of a municipal janitor would outweigh any additional time needed to manage an employee. For example, our multipurpose room is often used in the evenings and may need to be cleaned early the following morning for another user. A municipal janitor could be asked to come in for that purpose whereas a contractor may not be able to.*

## BUDGET IMPLICATIONS

At this time, the total cost for janitorial services for the Administrative Centre, Recreation Centre and Library/CED Centre would have been \$40,163.25 in the first year of the contract with Enslow's. In addition, we spend approximately \$200/month to clean Dr. Yee's intern's office and exam room and approximately \$600-\$700/month to clean Dr. Pierce's medical clinic.

Therefore, our annual expense for janitorial services within a year is at a minimum, \$49,763.25. Cleaning supplies are additional but will not be included in this report as any option would require the Municipality to purchase its own cleaning supplies. However, the purchase and maintenance of any required equipment (mop, vacuum, etc.) would be an added expense if the Municipality were to hire a janitor.

The only other bidder's total cost for the first year of the contract would have been \$90,541.80. For this reason, we have been forced to analyze the outsourcing of this service and consider whether performing the duties in-house would benefit the Municipality.

If the Municipality chose to hire a number of individuals to clean our facilities, the cost to fulfill 1,820 hours in the year of cleaning (which is equivalent to a full-time position), at a rate of \$20-\$25 per hour (average cost per hour for this service in the area) would be approximately \$36,400 to \$45,500. Although this option is slightly less expensive, the measurement and management of outcomes would be time consuming as noted above and we would still be required to provide equipment and cleaning supplies.

If the Municipality were to hire a municipal janitor, the position would report to the Director of Property Services and would have a salary range between \$34,680 to \$39,780, plus benefits at a maximum of \$8,400 for a total cost to the municipality of approximately \$48,180, at the highest.

## LEGAL IMPLICATIONS

N/A

## PUBLIC CONSULTATION/COMMUNICATIONS

N/A

## RECOMMENDATION

Based on the outsourcing analysis, which favours both financially and operationally the hiring of a municipal janitor, I recommend hiring a municipal janitor to provide the janitorial services for all municipal facilities and Dr. Pierce's clinic.

## SUGGESTED MOTION

Move to recommend that Council approve the addition of a Municipal Janitor position.

## ATTACHMENTS

- Proposed Municipal Janitor Job Description
- Tender Evaluation Report – MODB1907

## **JOB DESCRIPTION**

<b>Position Title:</b>	<b>Municipal Janitor</b>
<b>Salary Band:</b>	Supporter Salary Band
<b>Department:</b>	Property Services
<b>Reports to:</b>	Director of Property Services
<b>Status:</b>	Permanent, Fulltime
<b>Location:</b>	Various municipal locations.
<b>Hours:</b>	Normally 12:00 p.m. to 7:00 pm (35 hours/ week) with other hours for bookings or events outside of normal hours.
<b>Date:</b>	February 11, 2020

### **SCOPE**

The role of the Municipal Janitor is to clean and sanitize offices, meeting rooms, bathrooms, lunchrooms and dining room and public areas at the following municipal facilities:

- Administrative Centre
- Library/CED Centre
- Dr. Pierce's Clinic
- Sherose Island Recreation Centre Building
- Sandy Wickens Memorial Arena
- Visitor Information Centre
- Other buildings/facilities to be assigned from time to time

### **QUALIFICATIONS**

- High School Diploma, or the equivalent work-related experience.
- Previous custodial and grounds experience preferred.
- Strong organizational skills with the ability to multi-task.
- Strong attention to detail.
- Ability to work early morning or late-night shifts, if needed.
- Ability to understand and follow verbal and written instructions.
- Ability to lift and carry up to 25 pounds.
- Ability to climb ladders and work from heights.
- Ability to work independently and have strong self-motivation.

- Ability to manage time efficiently.
- Possess working knowledge of the methods, technique, and materials used in custodial work.
- Comfortable squatting, twisting, bending, and kneeling while using tools and performing maintenance tasks.
- Familiar with operating, caring for, and storing custodial equipment and supplies.

## **SUMMARY OF FUNCTIONS**

### **Principle Duties and Responsibilities:**

The Municipal Janitor shall work directly under the Director of Property Services. The following is a general outline of the duties and responsibilities. The listing is not intended to be all inclusive or to limit initiative to expand his/her function beyond this scope nor is it intended to limit the Director of Property Services and CAO's right to assign other duties.

#### General

1. Perform the regular daily janitorial duties required to keep buildings in a clean and neat condition.
2. Report any property damage or plumbing problems immediately to the Director of Property Services.
3. Carry out any and all duties and responsibilities that the Director of Property Services and CAO shall see fit to direct or that shall arise from time to time.

#### Daily Cleaning

4. Entrances and Lobbies
  - a. Tile floors to be dry and damp mopped with detergent.
  - b. Door glass to be cleaned (both sides) and metal doorframes to be wiped clean.
  - c. Horizontal surfaces (within reach) to be dusted.
  - d. Carpets and catch-mats to be vacuumed and cleaned as required.
  - e. Waste receptacles to be emptied and waste removed to a designated area.
  - f. Clean debris in front of outside doors to a maximum of six (6) feet (butts, cans, cups, paper, etc.) and around the property.
5. Corridors
  - a. Floors to be dry and damp mopped with detergent.
  - b. All horizontal ledges (within reach) to be dusted.
  - c. Waste receptacles to be emptied and waste removed to a designated area.

- d. Carpet runners to be vacuumed and stains removed.
6. Washrooms
- a. Floors to be swept and washed with germicidal cleaner.
  - b. Mirrors, counter tops, faucets, etc. to be cleaned and polished.
  - c. Basins, bowls (including undersides) to be washed and sanitized.
  - d. Toilet seats (including undersides) to be washed and sanitized.
  - e. Tops of partitions and other ledges to be dusted.
  - f. Paper towels and sanitary disposal receptacles to be emptied and cleaned.
  - g. Standard office waste receptacles to be emptied and damp wiped.
  - h. All toilet supplies to be replenished.
7. Offices, Conference Rooms, Multipurpose Room and Meeting Rooms
- a. Floors (carpet and hard) to be vacuumed and stains removed.
  - b. Standard office waste receptacles to be emptied and damp wiped.
  - c. Horizontal surfaces of furniture, fixtures, business equipment to be dusted.
8. Lunchrooms
- a. Tables and chairs to be damp wiped.
  - b. Microwave to be cleaned.
  - c. Countertops, sinks and faucets to be washed with germicidal cleaner.
  - d. Dishes to be cleaned and stored.
  - e. Waste receptacles to be emptied and waste removed to a designated area.

#### Periodic Cleaning

9. Entrances and Lobbies
- a. Hard floors to be washed monthly with germicidal cleaner.
  - b. Light fixture coverings to be washed as required.
10. Washrooms
- a. Partitions to be washed and sanitized.
11. Offices, Conference Rooms, Multipurpose Room and Meeting Rooms
- a. Vertical surfaces: sides of desks, tables, filing cabinets to be dusted once a week.
  - b. Wall hangings, tops of doors, etc. to be dusted once a week.
  - c. Window ledges and baseboards damp-wiped once a week.
  - d. All carpets to be completely vacuumed monthly with all dirt spots, smudges and stains removed.

12. Lunchrooms

- a. Fridge to be cleaned monthly and outdated food disposed of.
- b. Water cooler to be cleaned on a regular basis.

13. Windows

- a. The inside of all windows is to be cleaned as required.
- b. All exterior windows are to be cleaned as required.

DRAFT



## TENDER EVALUATION REPORT

### MODB1907

#### Description of Tender

This tender is for the provision of janitorial services for a three-year period at various municipal buildings located throughout the Municipality.

#### Details of Invitation

Tender invitation method: Open tender posted on the Nova Scotia Procurement website.

Tender invitation date: November 15, 2019

Tender closing date: November 28, 2019

Tender packages were opened on November 28, 2019 at 2:00 p.m. In attendance: Chris Frotten (Chief Administrative Officer), Suzy Atwood (Recorder) and two representatives of Buff Zone Cleaning Services Inc.

#### Tenders Received

Number of Tenders Received: 2

Details of Tenders Received:

Tenderers	Tendered Sums for First Year* (lowest first) + HST				
	Admin Ctr.	Library	Rec Ctr.	Arena	VIC
Enslow's Maintenance & Cleaning Services	\$20,780.00	\$7,969.50	\$11,413.75	\$10,171.75	\$2,909.50
Buzz Zone Cleaning Services Inc.	\$47,541.00	\$19,527.00	\$23,473.80	\$37,970.70	\$6,009.90

\*The costs increase by approximately 1.5% - 2.0% each year for the duration of the agreement.

#### Compliance with Tender Specifications

Tenderers (in order of tendered sum)	Compliance with tender specifications	Details of any non-compliance
Enslow's Maintenance and Cleaning Services	Yes	N/A

Buzz Zone Cleaning Services Inc.	Yes	N/A
----------------------------------	-----	-----

## Budget Implications

The annual budgeted amount for this service is typically \$35,000 but this year, it was increased to \$40,000. The new annual cost for the same service for the first year would be \$40,163.25.

### *Added Locations*

Two new locations – the Arena and the VIC – were added to this tender to assess the feasibility of procuring janitorial services for these locations. The Arena is currently cleaned by one of the two Arena Technicians. It is very difficult for the arena technicians to keep pace with the regular cleaning requirements in the washrooms, change rooms and public spaces – especially after large events/gatherings. For this reason, the cleaning has been inconsistent and is sometimes completed by volunteers. The VIC is open from May-September but does not receive regular cleaning during those months. Most of the minimal cleaning is performed by the seasonal employees of the VIC. Although this has met the minimum requirements, we were interested in learning what the cost may be provide a more consistent and higher level of service.

## Outsourcing Analysis

Upon an outsourcing analysis, it is recommended to continue outsourcing this service. However, based on the increasing costs, it is suggested to analyze this in great detail before the completion of this contract.

## Recommendation

It is recommended that the tender submitted by Enslow's Maintenance & Cleaning Services, without the cleaning of the Arena and VIC, be selected for the following reasons:

1. Upon evaluating the two tenders using the prescribed evaluation criteria, Enslow's Maintenance & Cleaning Services attained the most points.
2. The tendered cost of janitorial services for the Arena and VIC does not justify the procurement of this service.